





Summary of Key Issues and Review of Alternatives





Section 10.6 Cultural Resources

| Section 10.6 Cultural Resources | | | | |
|--|--|---|---|--|
| Key Topics and Issues | Plan Update Approach (Alternative B) | Existing Framework Plan (Alternative D) | Alternative A | Alternative C |
| <p>Cultural Resource Protection The County's rich history helps define the unique character and identity of the county.</p> <p>What level of protection should be afforded to the cultural resources within the county?</p> <p>Key Policies:</p> | <p>Provides protection as outlined in existing state and federal laws and guidelines, and includes updated references. Requires identification of cultural resources and mitigation of impacts (P1, 2, 5 S4,5) Calls for review and updating of existing implementing ordinances and guidelines to ensure appropriate protection (IM-1,2).</p> | <p>Provides protection for significant cultural resources; includes dated references to state and federal laws, guidelines and interest groups.</p> | <p>Provides additional protection through CEQA review (Sxxx) and cultural resources report (Sx) requirements for projects that might impact historic resources. Also establishes a County Cultural Resource Commission (Sxx).</p> | <p>Alternative C would update basic requirements for cultural resource protection, but would not otherwise expand cultural resource protection beyond the requirements of state and federal law.</p> |
| <p>Historic Structures Historic buildings are a particularly visible and important component of community character.</p> <p>What level of effort is appropriate to ensure conservation of these resources?</p> <p>Key Policies:</p> | <p>Encourages active support of local, state and federal historical registrations programs (IM3), promotes the use of the State Historic Building Code (IM4), and calls for establishing a system for identifying historic properties(IM5).</p> | <p>Encourages active support of local, state and federal historical registrations programs, promotes the use of the State Historic Building Code.</p> | <p>In addition to policy of Alt B, calls for efforts to develop a Certified Local Government Program through the State Office of Historic Preservation (IMx).</p> | <p>Alternative C would not promote the use of the Historic Building Code or encourage identification or registration of historic properties.</p> |

Plan Alternatives Comparison Chart Section 10.6 Cultural Resources

| Plan Alternative | | | | Section 10.6 Cultural Resources | Staff Remarks/ Implementation | Position R,M,D |
|------------------------|---|---|---|--|---|-------------------|
| 10.6.3 Goals | | | | | | |
| A | B | | D | CU-G1 Protection and Enhancement of Cultural Resources. Protected <u>and enhanced</u> cultural resources providing significant historic, scientific, educational, social and economic contributions to present and future generations. | Recommended staff revision a variation of FRWK 3530. | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| | | C | | CU-G1 Protection and Enhancement of Cultural Resources. Protected cultural resources providing significant historic, scientific, educational, social and economic contributions to present and future generations. | | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| 10.6.4 Policies | | | | | | |
| A | B | C | | CU-P1. Identification and Protection. Cultural resources shall be identified during ministerial and discretionary permit review, assessed as to significance, and if found to be significant, protected from deterioration, loss, or destruction. |   MIN, QJ S1,4,5 IM5 | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |

| | | | | | |
|----------|----------|----------|---|---|--|
| | | | D 3531.1 Identification and Protection. Cultural resources (including but not limited to archaeological, paleontological, and architectural sites, grave sites and cemeteries) shall be identified where feasible, assessed as to significance, and if found to be significant, protected from loss, or destruction. | | |
| A | B | C | CU-P2. Consultation. Tribal organizations, historical organizations, and applicable agencies shall be consulted during discretionary project review, zone reclassifications, and Plan amendments for the identification and protection of cultural resources. Consultation on ministerial permits shall be initiated if it has been determined the project may create a substantial adverse change in the significance of a historical resource. |  MIN, QJ S3 | |
| | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| | | | D 3531.2 Consultation. Concerned citizens, historical organizations, and applicable agencies shall be consulted during project review for the identification and protection of cultural resources. | | |
| A | B | | CU-P3. Avoid Loss or Degradation. Projects located in areas found known to have cultural resources <u>historic or prehistoric ruins, burial grounds, or archeological sites</u> shall be conditioned and designed to avoid loss or substantial degradation of these resources, <u>including inadvertent disturbance.</u> | Staff recommended additions to distinguish P3 from P1 and require additional precautions within known cultural resource areas.  MIN, QJ S4 | |
| | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| | | | D 3531.3. Avoid Loss or Degradation. Projects located in areas found to have cultural resources shall be conditioned and designed to avoid loss or substantial degradation of these resources. | | |

| | | | | | | |
|-------------------------|----------|----------|----------|---|--|--|
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| A | B | C | | CU-P4. Findings Necessary for Loss or Destruction. Cultural resources shall not be knowingly destroyed or lost through a ministerial or discretionary action unless: A. The site or resource has been found to be of insignificant value by representatives of the cultural resources community and relevant experts; or B. There is an overriding public benefit from the project and compensating mitigation to offset the loss is made part of the project. | Staff recommended additions to improve the title.   MIN, QJ | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| A | B | C | D | CU-P5. Mitigation. Mitigation measures shall be required where new development would adversely impact cultural resources. |   MIN, QJ S4 | |
| 10.6.5 Standards | | | | | | |
| A | B | C | | CU-S1. Cultural Resources. Cultural resources include, but are not limited to, any object, building, structure, site, area, or place that is culturally, historically, or archeologically significant, or is significant in the architectural, engineering, scientific, economic, agricultural, educational, social, political, military, or cultural annals of Humboldt County. Sites, resources, or structures placed in federal, state, or local historic registration programs shall also be recognized as historical resources. Cultural resources also include cultural places, as defined by California Public Resources Code Sections 5097.9 and 5097.993, including any Native American sanctified cemetery, place of worship, religious or ceremonial site, or sacred shrine or any Native American historic, cultural, or sacred site that is listed or may be eligible for listing in the California Register of Historic Resources, including any historic or prehistoric ruins, any burial ground, and any archeological or historic site. | | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |

| | | | | | | |
|----------|----------|----------|----------|--|--|--|
| A | B | C | D | CU-S2. Confidentiality. The exact location of archeological, paleontological, and grave sites shall not be publicly identified in order to prevent the possibility of theft or vandalism. | | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| A | B | C | | CU-S3. Tribal Organizations, Historical Organizations, and Applicable Agencies. Tribal organizations, historical organizations, and applicable agencies, include, but are not be limited to, tribal governments, the Humboldt County Historical Society, North Coastal Information Center, California Archeological Site Survey at Sonoma State University, Humboldt County Public Works and the Planning Division, the California State Office of Historic Preservation, and other Native American groups and affected citizens. | | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |

| | | | | | |
|---|---|--|--|---|--|
| A | B | | <p>CU-S4. Conditioning, Designing, or Mitigating Projects to Avoid Loss. Conditioning, designing, or mitigating projects to avoid loss of cultural resources in general, but archeological or paleontological resources in particular, shall include, where applicable:</p> <p>A. Change building and construction sites and/or road locations to avoid sensitive areas; or</p> <p>B. Provide protective cover for sites that cannot be avoided; or</p> <p>C. Provide for removal or transfer of culturally significant material by a cultural heritage specialist, professional archeologist, or geologist where appropriate and with the approval of all parties concerned.</p> <p>D. <u>For discretionary projects that involve ground disturbing activities, the following measure shall be included as a condition of approval or as a notation to be placed on development plans:</u></p> <p><u>"The project site is not located within an area where known cultural resources have been located. However, as there exists the possibility that undiscovered cultural resources may be encountered during construction activities, the following mitigation measures are required under state and federal law:</u></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <u>• If cultural resources are encountered, all work must cease and a qualified cultural resources specialist contacted to analyze the significance of the find and formulate further mitigation (e.g., project relocation, excavation plan, and protective cover).</u> <u>• Pursuant to California Health and Safety Code §7050.5, if human remains are encountered, all ground-disturbing work must cease and the County Coroner contacted."</u> <p><u>The applicant and successors in interest are ultimately responsible for ensuring compliance with this condition.</u></p> | <p>New wording required as a part of CEQA review process.</p> | |
| | | | <p>COMMENTS:</p> | | |

| | | | | | | |
|----------|----------|----------|----------|---|--|--|
| | | C | D | <p>CU-S4. Conditioning, Designing, or Mitigating Projects to Avoid Loss. Conditioning, designing, or mitigating projects to avoid loss of cultural resources in general, but archeological or paleontological resources in particular, shall include, where applicable:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> E. Change building and construction sites and/or road locations to avoid sensitive areas; or F. Provide protective cover for sites that cannot be avoided; or G. Provide for removal or transfer of culturally significant material by a cultural heritage specialist, professional archeologist, or geologist where appropriate and with the approval of all parties concerned. | | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| | B | C | | <p>CU-S5. Assessment of Impacts. A cultural resources <u>report study</u> prepared by a professional who meets the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's professional qualification guidelines (36 Code of Federal Regulations Part 61 as amended) may be required during environmental assessment to determine the presence, extent, and condition of cultural resources and the likely impact upon such resources. <u>For structures of historical significance, alternations and/or additions shall follow the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Archeology and Historic Preservation.</u></p> | The addition is necessary to implement the findings in the report. | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| A | | | | <p>CU-S5. Assessment of Impacts. A cultural resources <u>report study</u> prepared by a professional who meets the U.S. Secretary of the Interior's professional qualification guidelines (36 Code of Federal Regulations Part 61 as amended) shall be required during environmental assessment to determine the presence, extent, and condition of cultural resources and the likely impact upon such resources. For structures of historical significance, alternations and/or additions shall follow the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for Archeology and Historic Preservation.</p> | | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |

| | | | | |
|-----------------|--|--|--|--|
| <p>A</p> | | <p>CU-Sx. Cultural Resources Report Contents. A Cultural Resources Report should, at the minimum, contain:</p> <p>(1) Evidence of a full background literature search through the depository at the Humboldt County Historical Society. Whether the resource is on any federal, State or local list of designated historic resources. Whether the resource is identified in any information in the historical archives;</p> <p>(2) A brief description of the project parcel(s) and the expectations of the consultant at the onset of the inventory report;</p> <p>(3) A clear description of the methods and results of the field inventory including rationale for surface coverage and a brief discussion of any historic resources encountered. This treatment should be patterned after the <i>Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines for ARCHEOLOGY AND HISTORIC PRESERVATION</i> [As Amended and Annotated] - http://www.cr.nps.gov/local-law/arch_stnds_0.htm ;</p> <p>(4) A generally accurate map (7.5' USGS topographic, parcel map or engineers map) in a scale sufficient to show the intensity and coverage of the field inventory as well as the location of any resources encountered;</p> <p>(5) A description and evaluation of any structures and a determination of whether or not they qualify as historical resources. This evaluation should answer the following questions with respect to possible historic significance:</p> <p>a) Is it associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of local or regional history, or the cultural heritage of California, or the United States;</p> <p>b) Is it associated with the lives of persons important to local, California, or national history;</p> <p>c) Does it embody the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, region, or method of construction, or represent the work of a master or possess high artistic values;</p> <p>d) Has it yielded, or does it have the potential to yield, information important to the prehistory or history of the local area, California, or the nation.</p> <p>(6) a) Given the answers to 5. a. through d., Does the resource qualify as an historic resource? If the answer to 6a is no, and any of the answers to 5a through 5d is yes, explain why, in your assessment, the resource does not qualify as historic.</p> <p>b) Does the resource have integrity for the period of significance? The period of significance is the date or span of time within which significant events transpired, or significant individuals made their important contributions. Integrity is the authenticity of a historical resource's physical identity as evidenced by the survival of characteristics or historic fabric that existed during the resource's period of significance.</p> | | |
|-----------------|--|--|--|--|

| | | | | | |
|----------|--|--|--|--|--|
| | | | <p>c) Identify whether or not the resource retains enough of its historic character of appearance to be recognizable as an historical resource and able to convey the reasons for significance. If it is determined that a resource has lost its historic character or appearance, does it still have the potential to yield significant scientific or historical information or specific data?</p> <p>d) Is the historic resource located within a historic district or a concentration of historic buildings, structures, objects, or sites with precise boundaries that share a common historical, cultural or architectural background? If so, and if it is determined that the resource lacks individual significance as an historical resource, could the resource be considered a contributor to the significance of the historic district or concentration of historic structures?</p> <p>(7) If the resource is historic, provide recommended means to avoid or lessen development related impacts to any historical resources encountered on the parcel(s);</p> <p>(8) The names of any local persons consulted during the preparation of the report;</p> <p>(9) Statement of Qualifications (education, employment, field experience, previous reports and publications in historic resources).</p> | | |
| | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| A | | | <p>CU-Sxx. Cultural Resource Commission Recommendations & Mitigation. The conclusions, findings and recommendations of the Cultural Resources Report will be evaluated during the environmental review process, and will be referred to the Cultural Resource Commission. The Cultural Resource Commission will make recommendations on historic resources to the Planning Commission. Applicants should be encouraged to avoid impacts to historical resources where feasible. When this is not feasible, mitigation measures shall be incorporated into the project to lessen the impact of the project on these resources. Mitigation shall be in accordance with Appendix K of the State CEQA Guidelines.</p> | | |
| | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| A | | | <p>CU-Sxxx. CEQA Review. Historical resources as provided in Section 15064.5 of the State CEQA Guidelines shall include: 1) a resource listed in, or determined to be eligible for listing in, the California Register of Historical Resources; 2) a resource listed in a local register of historical resources; or 3) any object, building structure, site, area or place which the County Planning Division determines to be historically or culturally significant.</p> | | |

| | | | | | | |
|---------------------------------------|----------|----------|----------|---|---|--|
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| 10.6.6 Implementation Measures | | | | | | |
| A | B | C | D | CU-IM1. Review Existing Protections. Review existing ordinances and guidelines and make necessary amendments to assure the protection of cultural resources. | | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| A | B | C | D | CU-IM2. Implementation Guidelines. Adopt implementation guidelines for cultural resource identification, protection, mitigation and enhancement. heritage, archeological, or paleontological resources and for historic resources. | Staff recommended re-write for clarity. | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| A | B | | D | CU-IM3. Historical Registration. Encourage and actively support federal, state, and local historical registration programs. | | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| A | B | | D | CU-IM4. Historic Building Code. Promote the use of the Historic Building Code of the State of California for historical sites. | | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |
| A | B | | | CU-IM5. Historic Building Identification. Establish and maintain a system for identifying historic properties. | | |
| | | | | COMMENTS: | | |

| | | | | | |
|---|--|--|--|--|--|
| A | | | <p>CU-IMx. Certified Local Government Program. Pursue County certification under the Certified Local Government Program through the State Office of Historic Preservation (SHPO). Requirements of the program include:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> -Enforce appropriate legislation for the designation and protection of historic properties. -Establish and maintain a qualified historic preservation commission. -Maintain a system for identifying historic properties. -Provide for public participation and perform other agreed functions delegated by SHPO. | | |
| | | | <p>COMMENTS:</p> | | |
| A | | | <p>CU-IMx. Map Resource Areas. Update the County sensitivity map (not site specific) that identifies potential locations of archaeological resources, and survey and evaluate existing archaeology resources every three years (while maintaining confidentiality regarding the location of archaeological sites).</p> | | |
| | | | <p>COMMENTS:</p> | | |